



Bu proje Avrupa Birliđi ve Trkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.



Avrupa Birliđi Bakanlıđı
IPA II Teknik Destek Projesi

Ministry for EU Affairs
Technical Assistance for IPA II

“IPA II: Taking EU funding to the next level”

12.-14.12.2017 –Training on Monitoring

Ivana Varga



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliđi ve Trkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.



Training on Monitoring

Day 2

31.1.2018



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe



REPUBLIC OF TURKEY
MINISTRY FOR EU AFFAIRS



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Training Agenda – Day 2



Sessions	Topic
9:30-10:45	<p>Welcome</p> <p>Review of Day 1</p> <p>Planning and implementation of monitoring activities during the procurement phase</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Preparation of timetable for submission of technical documents - Submission of technical documents - Evaluation process <p>Planning and implementation of monitoring activities during the activity implementation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Verification of the daily activity progress: technical monitoring (outputs) and financial monitoring (expenditure) - Risk management and monitoring of preventive and mitigation measures - Management of contracts: contract amendments, revision of indicators, contractor's reports
10:45-11:00	Coffee Break
11:00-12:30	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Desk and on-the-field activity monitoring - reviewing beneficiary's / contractor's reports - performing monitoring visits during the implementation of activities (desk preparation, visit implementation, use of checklists) - Monitoring specificities for different types of contracts (service, supply, works)
12:30-13:30	Lunch
13:30-14:45	<p>Planning and implementation of monitoring activities after the end of activity implementation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Delivery of outputs - Verification of sustainability and financial viability - Performing monitoring visits (desk preparation, visit implementation, use of checklists) - Monitoring specificities for different types of contracts (service, supply, works)
14:45-15:00	Coffee Break
15:00-16:00	<p>Preparation of Monitoring Reports: focus on state of play, summarising the conclusions on the performance and preparation of the action plan / corrective measures</p> <p>Follow-up actions</p>
16:00-16:15	Questions & Answers for Day 2
16:15-16:30	<p>Exit test</p> <p>Evaluation of the training by participants</p> <p>Closure of the training</p>



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring activities during action implementation phase



- PHASE 1- Procurement and grant award phase
- PHASE 2- Implementation phase (from the signature of the contract to the end of the contract)
- PHASE 3- Ex-post monitoring (after the end of the contract to the Programme closure)



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring of the procurement phase



- Preparation of timetable for submission of technical documents:
 - The *procurement phase* starts with the approval of the annual action programme and ends with the signature of the contracts
 - This phase is focused on the selection and contracting of service providers, suppliers of goods, works contractors, grant beneficiaries and twinning partners



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring of the procurement phase



- The activities in this phase include:
 - preparation and approval of tender documents and guidelines for applicants,
 - launching tenders/call for proposals and the evaluation of tenders/proposals
 - contracting
- The CFCU is the main responsible body for the procurement and contracting. The end-beneficiaries support procurement process by drafting of the tender document



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring of the procurement phase



- The responsibility of the end beneficiary institution in this phase include:
 - preparation of the procurement plan for the action,
 - reporting on progress on procurement plan
 - Implementation of corrective action, in case of delays or other problems



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring of the procurement phase



- The efficient tendering and contracting requires:
 - Timely preparation of tenders;
 - Good quality and compliant tender documentation;
 - Efficient assessment of tenders and applications
- The preparation of the technical documents has to start immediately after the approval of the action document by the EC (adoption of Commission Implementing Decision for the Annual action programme)



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Preparation of timetable for submission of technical documents



- The LI-DPA is responsible to ensure good planning and efficient monitoring of the tender documents preparation
- After notification of the NIPAC, it has to coordinate preparation of the timetable for the tender document preparation
- The timetable for the preparation of technical documents is drafted by the end-beneficiaries in the format provided in Annex D.01



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Preparation of timetable for submission of technical documents



- The LI-DPA has to review the timetable received from the end-beneficiaries and to verify that it is realistic and within the deadlines set in the Action Document
- The successful and timely completion of the contracting phase often requires effective coordination of different bodies and institutions
- Immediately after the signature of the Financing Agreement, the LI will request setting of the envisaged Steering Committees



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring of the timely submission of technical documents



- The LI-DPA will monitor the compliance with the approved timetable for tender documents preparation at least on quarterly basis
- In case of delays or risk of delays, the LI-DPA has to ensure that end-beneficiaries implement corrective measures through:
 - organising meetings with the end-beneficiaries;
 - reporting to NIPAC on problems and risks during the Implementation Review Meetings;
 - providing regular follow-up on the approved corrective measures



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring of the timely submission of technical documents



- The LI-DPA sets in key performance indicators related to the monitoring of the procurement phase
- The indicative list of indicators is as follows:
 - Months of tender preparation by the end-beneficiaries;
 - Stability of the procurement plans;
 - Deviations from the procurement targets;
 - Ex-ante rejections by the CFCU and EC.



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Assessment of the quality of the received tender documents



- The end-beneficiaries have to prepare and submit to the LI-DPA the following tender documents:

Type of tender		
Procurement (Service, Supply, Works)	Grants	Twinning
Terms of Reference/Technical Specifications Market research/cost estimates Works dossier, including drawings, specifications, ground survey report	Guidelines for applicants and application package	Twinning fiche
Nominations of the voting members of the evaluation committee (CVs)	Nominations of the voting members of the evaluation committee (CVs) Approval of the selection of the assessors	Nomination of the members of the selection committee
Answer to clarifications to tender documents	Answer to clarifications to Guidance to applicants and application documents	Answer to clarifications



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Assessment of the quality of the received tender documents



- The tender documents are prepared within the deadlines set in the tender documents preparation timetable
- After receiving the tender documents the LI-DPA has to verify:
 - Compliance with the provisions of the Action Document;
 - Overall quality of documents
- Main requirements for the tender documents are given in PRAG (Sections 3-6 and in the instruction fields of the standard templates of the ToR, TS, Guidelines for Applicants); Twining Manual (Section 2 and Annex C.1)



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring activities during the implementation phase



- PHASE 2- From the signature of the contract to the end of the contract
- Activities in implementation:
 - Execution of the Contract
 - Payment process
 - Contract amendments
 - Action Document modifications
 - Irregularities
 - Acceptance committees
 - Completion of the contract



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring activities during during the implementation phase



- End beneficiaries monitor implementation process closely in order to ensure whether the contract is executed properly in terms of technical aspects and the activities are completed in time
- The implementation phase starts after the signature of the contracts and ends with the completion of the contracts
- During this phase activities are implemented, outputs and benefits are delivered and interventions start to create benefits or changes in behaviour for target beneficiaries and target groups (outcomes)



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring activities during during the implementation phase



- The end-beneficiaries have a main responsibility for the day to day monitoring of the performance of the contractors and of internal monitoring for achievement of project targets
- They are responsible for the efficient use of the allocated resources and for the assistance to the activities of the contractors, including where relevant:
 - appointment of counterpart personnel;
 - appointing the relevant staff to participate in training activities;



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring activities during during the implementation phase



- organisation, selection and appointment of members of working groups, steering and coordination committees, seminars by the beneficiary as per work plan;
- allocation of working space and facilities for the team (if applicable);
- arrangement of all legal procedures (e.g. construction permits) to allow construction or refurbishment activities



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring activities during during the implementation phase



- The role of the LI-DP in the implementation phase is to ensure that:
 - end-beneficiaries effectively implement and monitor actions;
 - end-beneficiaries identify risks for achievement of expected results and timely and effectively implement discussed and agreed risk mitigation actions;
 - Steering Committees function effectively (meet regularly and discuss results of the actions);
 - end-beneficiaries collect information on performance indicators



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Activity monitoring



- In many cases, particularly during the early stages of the project, the response will either be a 'nil return' or disproportionately low compared to the amount of expenditure
- For the majority of the activity's life, typically it will be expected that 'X'% of the total activity value will be incurred and claimed, but only 'Y'% of outputs will be achieved, where $X > Y$
- Monitoring should be carried out from the commencement of all projects, and beneficiaries should allocate sufficient resources for data collection



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Planning of monitoring activities



- The annual monitoring plan on contract level is drafted using the template given in Annex D.10
- It includes all planned monitoring activities:
 - participation in Steering Committees,
 - review of progress reports, prepared by contractor/ implementing partners,
 - review of progress and monitoring reports, prepared by the end-beneficiary,
 - monitoring visits and other project meetings



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Planning of monitoring activities



- The progress of execution of the annual monitoring plan is reviewed regularly by the LI Coordinator
- Where necessary the plan is updated to take into account new risks or problems in project implementation
- The execution of the monitoring plan is reported to the Sectoral Monitoring Committee meetings and in the Annual report on the implementation of IPA II assistance in the Fundamental rights sub-field



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Participation in Steering Committee meetings



- The main duties of the Steering Committee include:
 - Review of progress and achievements of stated results;
 - Strategic monitoring and decision making on issues such as changes in the activity/contract and indicators to better respond to the needs of target groups/beneficiaries;
 - Assistance in operational planning of activities and ensuring coordination between stakeholders;
 - Assistance in the assessment of risks or problems and risk management;
 - Assessment of quality and verification of project technical reports and deliverables (if envisaged in the tender documents - typical in case of studies, etc.).



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Review of technical and financial progress reports



- The CFCU is responsible for the contract management and approval of contractors reports and payment claims. Prior to the approval of the CFCU, reports are checked and verified 'read and approve' by the end-beneficiary.
- The LI has to verify that end-beneficiaries execute the checks in a timely manner and in line with requirements of the CFCU
- Based on provisions of the Agreement with the CFCU, the LI has a responsibility to carry out check of the reports and payment claims and to notify CFCU in case of discrepancies between the report and findings of the monitoring.
- The LI carries out the check of main contract implementation issues listed in Annex D.12:



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Review of technical and financial progress reports



- The following is checked:
 - All planned activities for the period have been implemented;
 - The planned outputs for the period have been delivered;
 - There are no significant delays or modifications in the implementation of activities;
 - There are no significant potential problems that may delay or jeopardise the achievement of projected targets on outputs and results;
 - There are no discrepancies between the report and the findings of the monitoring activities of the LI;



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.



Review of technical and financial progress reports

- End-beneficiary is satisfied with the performance of the contractor and has no significant comments to the report.
- In case of problems identified, LI issues recommendations to the end-beneficiary and follows their implementation
- In case of discrepancies between reports and findings of the monitoring, or major omission of the report, LI request amendment of the report by notifying end-beneficiary, CFCU and, in case of suspected irregularities conducts irregularity procedure



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits



- The main purpose of the monitoring visits is to assess the progress of actions against stated targets and the (expected) level of achievement of objectives and risks
- Monitoring visit will focus on collecting and analysing information:
 - continuous relevance, efficiency and effectiveness of actions (resource mobilisation, activities undertaken and results delivered) and the quality of process;
 - efficiency of management;
 - risks and problems and corrective actions to be taken.



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits



- The monitoring visit are carried out in the place of operation (training facilities, works site, place where equipment is installed, etc.) or to the project office, where the purpose is to meet project team, end-beneficiary and stakeholders.
- The timing of the visit is determined based on the analysis of the nature of project and the objective of the monitoring visit.
- The following general rules apply:
 - All visits are executed prior the approval of final reports;
 - On-the spot checks of the projects with tangible outputs (delivery of equipment, etc.) are carried out after the delivery of the outputs;



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits



- In case of construction projects the visits may be carried out during the execution of works, and after completion of works.
- Where projects have intangible results or results that are difficult to trace (e.g. training projects) the monitoring visits are carried out during the execution of the activity.



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits



- The minimum requirements of the number of visit per contract:

Type of contract	Number of visits	Timing
Service contract Direct grants Twinning contracts	At least 1 visit per contract, with the exception contracts below EUR 1 000 000 and low risk contracts	After the submission of the interim or final report
Supply contracts Works contract	At least 1 visit of contract of value above EUR 1 000 000	After the delivery of supplies After completion of works
Grant schemes	At least 1 visit during the grant scheme implementation (no visits to individual grant projects)	After the first year of implementation



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits



- *Prior the visit* the monitoring expert defines visit objectives and scope on the basis of desk review:
 - Collects and reviews documents relating to the contracts (i.e contract, monitoring/progress reports, minutes of meetings, correspondence, etc.);
 - Conducts an analysis for the collected documents;
 - Identifies visit objectives to be made and issues to be discussed;
 - Prepares visit plan;
 - Discuss visit objectives with the LI-DPA Coordinator (in case of high risk projects);
 - Confirms the visit schedule with end-beneficiary/contractor.



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits



- *During the visit* the monitoring expert:
 - Execute visit, planned meetings and checks;
 - Collects documents/take pictures, if necessary.
 - Where documentation is not available at the time of the visit, the Contractor is given a deadline for their submission (up to 10 WD);
 - If irregularities are suspected or detected the monitoring experts does not try to investigate it but to collect all documents that signal an irregularity and report on irregularity within 1 WD after completion of the visit following the procedure on Irregularities
 - Provides a preliminary feed-back on achievements and major identified problems and reaches agreements on the corrective actions, to the level possible prior the detailed examination of collected data.



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits



- *After the visit*, the monitoring expert analyses the collected data/and collects additional information, where required. Based on collected information from various sources the monitoring expert prepares reports following templates given in Annex D.13-D.16.
- The report has to be sufficiently detailed, that an external reader can be in a position to understand (from the report or its annexes):
 - what was checked during the visit and how it was checked:
 - If people were interviewed – their names has to be stated;
 - If documents were reviewed – they should be listed;



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits



- what are the deviations between the contract requirements and the actual implementation;
 - what are the conclusions of the monitoring expert;
 - what are the recommendations.
-
- In case of actions with significant problems in implementation, identified during the visit, the LI prepares and sends written recommendations on improvement of performance



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – service contracts



- Activity progress:
 - Are the activities being implemented in line with the Contract and the work plan envisaged in the Inception Report?
 - If there have been changes to the nature of the activities, have they been reflected in addenda/notification if necessary?
 - If there have been changes in the schedule, do the changes seem reasonable?
 - Are the outputs/results (if indicated) of the Activity being achieved in line with the contract and the work plan?
 - Is it likely that all activities will be completed by the end of contract implementation / that the specific objective(s) of the Activity will be achieved?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – service contracts



- Activity management:
 - Does the beneficiary possess sufficient staff capacity (both in terms of quantity and quality) to manage the Activity?
 - Does the beneficiary have a logical, consistent, regular and reliable system for monitoring project activities and outputs?
 - Is the beneficiary aware of rules on minor and major changes to the Activity content and its contractual obligations (e.g. reallocations, EU visibility, pre-financing of the balance, submission of reports)?
 - Is the filing of Activity documentation logical, systematic and complete?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – service contracts



- Activity sustainability:
 - Is it clear who is responsible for ensuring sustainability of the outputs/results after the Activity is completed?
 - Is the beneficiary aware of how the activities or use of outputs/results will be financed once the Activity ends?
 - Will the outputs/results of the Activity be used after it is completed?
 - In case there are follow up Activity envisaged, is it known how they might be financed?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – supply contracts



- Activity implementation before delivery:
 - Does the beneficiary possess sufficient staff capacity to manage the Activity?
 - Is the implementation of the contract going according to schedule?
 - Are all location(s) ready for the delivery of equipment?
 - Has the beneficiary done the preparatory work for installation and running operationally the equipment once delivered?
 - Has the beneficiary fulfilled its contractual obligations without problems and without need for additional assistance (e.g. internet connection; electricity)?



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – supply contracts



- Activity implementation after delivery:
 - Are all equipment delivered/installed? Is the place of installation in-line with the contract?
 - Are physical conditions of place where the equipment is installed acceptable?
 - Is the equipment being used in accordance with the purpose stated in the contract? How frequently (supporting documents)? If not, why?
 - Is the equipment being used for the purpose laid down in the Action Document (and other relevant project-related documents)?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – supply contracts



- Is the equipment being used by the appropriate staff?
- Have technical manuals (explaining how to use the equipment) delivered?
- Has appropriate training been provided (supporting documents: who trained whom, where, when, for how long)?
- Does the Contractor comply with the warranty obligations in accordance with the contract?
- Does the Contractor provide after-sales services in accordance with the contract (if applicable)?
- Are visibility logos applied to the items?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – supply contracts



- Activity sustainability:
 - Is it clear who is responsible for ensuring sustainability of the outputs after the Activity is completed?
 - Is the beneficiary aware of how the use of outputs will be financed once the Activity ends (e.g. maintenance of the equipment)?
 - Will the outputs/results of the Activity be used after it is completed?
 - In case there are follow up Activity envisaged, is it known how they might be financed?



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – works contracts



- Inspection of the site:
 - Are persons performing the check wearing the safety equipment?
 - Are safety procedures followed?
 - Is the relevant Contractor's personnel present on the site?
 - Is the relevant Engineer's personnel present on the site?
 - Is the site surrounded by an adequate fence?
 - Is control of the access to the site adequate?
 - Are all subcontractors which are present on the site approved through a standard procedure?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – works contracts



- Control of the works:
 - Is progress of the works in line with the Contract?
 - Have any variation been identified?
 - In case of variation identified, was it reflected in the Variation Order / Addendum?
 - Are Detailed designs available?
 - Are construction diaries available on the site for inspection?
 - Is the list of materials and equipment (including the certificates of origin) available and the origin of materials and equipment eligible?
 - Is machinery quality generally acceptable?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – works contracts



- Activity implementation:
 - Is it likely that all activities will be completed by the end of Contract implementation?
 - Are the outputs/results (if indicated) of the project being achieved in line with the Contract?
 - Are any disposals of debris or pollution problems identified?
 - Is visibility of EU co-financing ensured?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – works contracts



- Inspection of the contractor:
 - Are the Contractor's reports (weekly, monthly – as appropriate) being submitted to the Engineer in due time?
 - Do the Contractor's reports reflect accurately the observations of the monitoring visit?
 - Are the Engineer's reports (weekly, monthly – as appropriate) being submitted to the CFCU in due time?
 - Do the Engineer's reports reflect accurately the observations of the monitoring visit?
 - Does the Contractor identify any problem in the communication with any of the participants in works contract?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits



- Plan for monitoring visits is prepared on the basis of assessed risk profiles:
 - there are inconsistencies in project implementation reports;
 - irregularities detected;
 - any other problems or risks identified
- Monitoring visits are performed to get timely assurance that project objectives and results will be achieved as planned



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – summary



- Project information:
 - Overall and Specific objective
 - Expected results
 - Activities
- Activity progress and results:
 - Activities *<to provide brief chronological description of activities/works carried out>*,
 - Results and Outputs
 - Indicators
 - Disbursement
 - Reports (including procurement status and visibility requirements)



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – summary



- Project management and filing
- Management issues *<responsibilities, problems and corrective actions implemented, cooperation with partners, knowledge of procedures, general filing, procurement filing, payments filing, etc.>*
- Sustainability
- Problems (including irregularities) *<problems identified, proposed corrective actions, responsibilities, current status>*
- Assessment and recommendations to beneficiary (including deadlines)



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visits – summary



- Conclusion / Overall summary of Activity implementation
- Was the risk ranking of the project confirmed?
- Will it need to be visited again?
- Did the major issues arising from the progress report prove to be serious ones?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Implementation reviews meetings



- tool to regularly monitor progress and performance
- provide an opportunity to discuss progress and resolve problems
- organized by the LI-DPA in cooperation with the NIPAC with EUD
- prior to the implementation review meeting, LI has to prepare as short *summary of the status of actions implementation* (based on information taken from the progress reports, monitoring visit reports or project meetings minutes)



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Implementation reviews meetings



- The LI has to ensure participation of end-beneficiaries and, if needed, contractors, of actions with significant implementation problems.
- During the meeting the status of actions is discussed and where necessary corrective actions are formulated.
- The LI has to take record of all agreed corrective actions, to ensure their implementation and to report on the next implementation review meeting



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

ROM reviews



- The Results Oriented Monitoring (ROM) is a system for *independent review* of EU supported actions
- The ROM is designed to provide reliable and timely information on performance of actions as well as to formulate recommendations for the improvement of implementation and lessons learned for future programming
- The reviewed actions are assessed against four criteria - relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, and sustainability



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

ROM reviews



- The ROM reviews are implemented by ROM teams composed of external experts and NIPAC M&E Unit experts
- The NIPAC Secretariat prepares an annual plan for the ROM reviews
- The LI may approach NIPAC services with a request for conducting ROM review of an activity / component, in case of serious risks that require external expertise



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

ROM reviews



- The LI will support ROM missions through:
 - Provision of information and documents on:
 - progress and results of assessed actions;
 - monitoring activities executed by the LI-DPA.
 - Assistance to ROM experts for establishing contracts with the end-beneficiaries, if required;
 - Attendance and participation in meetings organised by ROM experts
- The agreed follow-up actions of the ROM reviews have to be implemented by the end-beneficiaries and monitored by the LI



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Sectoral Monitoring Committee



- The SMC deliberate based on reports provided by the LI-DPA/CFCU, and have the following tasks:
- review the *progress of ongoing actions* towards meeting the objectives, achieving the planned outputs and results, and assessing the impact and sustainability of the on-going programmes and actions
- review the *actions' continuous coherence* with the on-going policy dialogue, the related national and regional sector strategies and/or regional activities in the country;
- review *annual implementation reports*, including financial execution of the actions;



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Sectoral Monitoring Committee



- examine relevant findings and conclusions as well as proposals for *remedial follow-up actions stemming from the on-the-spot checks, monitoring and evaluations*, if available;
- discuss any relevant aspects of the functioning of the *management and control systems*;
- discuss any *problematic issues and actions*;
- review *information on publicity, transparency, visibility and communication* measures.



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Annual Report on the



implementation of IPA assistance

- The annual report on the implementation assistance in the IPA II Fundamental rights sub-field has to present:
 - programming, monitoring and evaluation, communication and visibility activities;
 - main achievements and problems encountered in meeting the required conditionalities and in ensuring sustainability, related measures taken/planned on sector and action level;
 - progress in reforms of the sector and sector policy maturity;



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Annual Report on the



implementation of IPA assistance

- main horizontal problems encountered and mitigating measures taken, problems encountered during implementation of activities;
- information on the indicators set in the action documents
- The annual report has to cover all *actions* in the IPA II Fundamental rights sub-sector (in procurement or implementation phase)
- The LI collects information from end-beneficiaries on progress of action and level of achievement of the performance indicators and submits the report to NIPAC



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Contract modifications



- Contracts may be modified during their duration, if the circumstances affecting project implementation have changed since the initial contract was signed.
- Any changes to the contract must be made officially by means of an administrative order or an addendum in accordance with the rules given in the General Conditions of the Contract and CFCU procedures
- Substantial changes to the contract are to be formalised in a formal written addendum, signed by the contracting parties. *An addendum* is required for the extension of the contract execution period and significant modifications of the activities, consortium partners, budget or replacement of key experts



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Contract modifications



- Small changes in the contract, such as small changes in activities, variations and related small budget reallocations in services, supply and works contract require prior written *Administrative order/Side Letter* by the CFCU
- Contract modification must not alter the competition conditions prevailing at the time the contract was awarded and therefore fundamental alterations of the Terms of Reference/Technical Specifications cannot be approved
- Contracts can only be modified within the execution period of the contract



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Contract modifications



- Modifications cannot be done retroactively
- Any modification extending the execution period of a contract must be such that implementation and final payment can be completed before the expiry of the Financing Agreement under which the initial contract was financed
- The requests for contract modifications are prepared by the contractors in consultation with end-beneficiaries and Steering Committees, where applicable. LI makes a first check of all requests for contract modifications and notifies CFCU. CFCU has overall responsibility for the contracts management and has the right to disregard LI recommendations



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Contract modifications – service contract



- The most common modifications:
 - derogation from standard working hours (work during weekends and public holidays)
 - amendment of activities which do not affect the basic purpose of the contract such as “additions, omissions, substitutions, changes in quality, quantity, specified sequence, method or timing of implementation of the services.”
 - reallocation of funds and working days



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Contract modifications – supply contract



- The most common modifications:
 - Prolongation of the duration if the circumstances affecting project implementation have changed since the initial contract was signed
 - Change in the (im)possibility to deliver the goods according to the prescribed technical specification
 - Change in the location of delivery / installation



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Contract modifications – works contract



- The most common modifications:
 - Increase of the Total Contract Amount
 - Extension of the Time for the Completion
 - Introduction of new subcontractors (if applicable)
 - Variation to change any part of the works if necessary for the proper completion and/or functioning of the works (additions, omissions, substitutions, changes in quality, quantity, form, character, kind, position, dimension, level or line and changes in the specified sequence, method or timing of execution of the works



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Revision of Indicators



- Approved indicators may be revised, if during the implementation of the programmes it will be found out:
 - there are no data sources for calculating one or more indicators or there is a low cost benefit for collecting data;
 - one or more indicators are not relevant for the programme monitoring;
 - targets are unrealistic;
 - new indicators are needed.
- The OSs will submit a request of modification of indicators, which will be reviewed, and where well justified, submitted to the Commission following approval by NIPAC



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring activities after the end of contract implementation



- PHASE 3- From the end of the contract to the Programme closure
- Lead Institution monitors the activities completed in order to ensure that the objectives set out in the relevant Action are achieved



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Continuity of operations



- Important aspect in the context of IPA II programming period
- „The sectoral monitoring committee shall report to the IPA monitoring committee and may make proposals on any corrective action to ensure the achievement of the objectives of the actions and enhance the efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the assistance provided” (IR 447/2014, Article 19)
- Action Document – obligatory part: Sustainability (financial, economic, institutional, social, environmental)



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Continuity of operations



- Responsibility of the Lead Institution / Operating Structure:
- Monitors the activities completed in order to ensure that the objectives set out in the relevant Actions are achieved, the activity outcomes are in place and in use in line with the purpose of activity/action
- In case the relevant authorities (EC, AA, NAO etc.) detect any findings with regard to disuse of the activity outcome or a situation where the outcomes are used for different purposes rather than that of activity/action purpose, the LI/OS takes necessary measures in order to obviate de-commitment



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Ex-post monitoring



- The LI plans and executes ex-post monitoring to assess the *relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability* of the IPA II assistance
- LI will co-ordinate ex-post monitoring activities with the NIPAC Secretariat ex-post ROM reviews. In planning of the ex-post activities, it will also take into account the planned final/ex-post evaluations
- The LI will not plan ex-post monitoring to contracts:
 - covered by ex-post ROM or ex-post evaluation;
 - twining contracts ex-post monitoring, of which is executed by TAIEX;
 - grant contracts ex-post monitoring, of which is a responsibility of the end-beneficiary



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Ex-post monitoring



- For the remaining contracts the ex-post monitoring will be scheduled as follows:
 - all contracts with supply of equipment or works above EUR 500.000;
 - service and direct grant contracts with identified sustainability risks (during the monitoring)
- The findings of the ex-post monitoring will be analysed by the LI and lessons learned will be presented in the final reports for implementation of actions, prepared by the LI at the closure of the programmes and taken into account in programming of future action documents



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Planning and executing project durability checks



- The sustainability and financial viability checks are carried out after the completion of operations
- This especially concerns the project with the condition to maintain the investment for a certain number of years (generally from 3 to 5)
- In this case at least one ex-post field visit shall be performed, before the period established for maintenance of the investment is due to expire, in order to check that the investment is still in place



Bu proje Avrupa Birliđi ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Planning and executing project durability checks



- In case the investment is found to have been sold out or otherwise unduly dismantled, the funds shall be recovered and irregularity procedure applied



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Ex-post visits – service contracts



- Activity sustainability:
 - Are the outputs/results of the Activity used after it is completed?
 - Who is responsible for ensuring sustainability of the outputs/results after the Activity is completed?
 - Are the activities or use of outputs/results continued to be financed once the Activity ended?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Ex-post visits – supply contracts



- Activity sustainability:
 - Is the equipment being used in accordance with the purpose stated in the contract? How frequently (supporting documents)? If not, why?
 - Is the equipment being used for the purpose laid down in the Action Document (and other relevant project-related documents)?
 - Is the equipment being used by the appropriate staff?
 - Does the Contractor provide after-sales services in accordance with the contract (if applicable)?
 - Are visibility logos applied to the items?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Ex-post visits – supply contracts



- Activity sustainability:
 - Who is responsible for ensuring sustainability of the outputs after the Activity is completed?
 - How the use of outputs is financed after the Activity ended (e.g. maintenance of the equipment)?
 - Are the outputs/results of the Activity used after it is completed?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Ex-post visits – works contracts



- Activity sustainability:
 - Who is responsible for ensuring sustainability of the outputs after the Activity is completed?
 - How the use of outputs is financed after the Activity ended (e.g. maintenance of the investment)?
 - Are the outputs/results of the Activity used after it is completed?



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visit Report



- content depends on the check-list filled and information collected during visit
- contain clear recommendations to be undertaken and deadlines for implementation of any corrective actions
- the Monitoring visit Report is sent to the checked institution with the request to provide comments
- after receiving the comments, they are included into the final report which is sent to the checked institution with the request for fulfillment of the recommendations within the defined deadline



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Monitoring visit Report



- the results of monitoring visits shall be evaluated to establish whether any problems encountered are of systematic character, entailing a risk for other similar operations or final beneficiaries
- If the findings are applicable only to the checked institution, the fulfillment of the recommendations is regularly followed-up in accordance with the given deadlines



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

The most common findings from ex-post visits



- Archiving (audit trail) – documentation is not available, it is not stored in a way to allow for proving the audit trail
- Activity ownership – project team is not anymore employed in the beneficiary institution, the existing employees are not adequately informed about Activity results and outputs
- Activity results' sustainability not ensured – examples:
 - Out of 4 developed educational programmes, only one is in implementation
 - Developed web based e-learning programme is not operational due to the costs of maintainance of the web host domain
 - Strategy developed is not in implementation due to the political change



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

The most common findings from ex-post visits



- Supply contracts – examples:
 - Procured equipment is not in use (packed in boxes)
 - Part of the procured equipment is not in use (broken parts, not requested to be fixed)
 - Part of the procured equipment is missing
 - The visibility logo on EU financing is missing
- Works contracts – examples:
 - Construction not in use due to incompliance with user's needs
 - Construction in bad conditions due to missing maintenance



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Ex-post monitoring



- The NIPAC Secretariat's M&E Unit will co-ordinate the ex-post monitoring activities undertaken by the LIs and NAO. The unit's tasks at this stage consist of the following:
 - Receiving monitoring plans of LIs/OSs for monitoring the sustainability and/or assessing the financial viability, the efficiency and effectiveness of the actions;
 - Based on the information provided by the OSs, prepare its own ex-post monitoring plan in order to prevent duplications;



Bu proje Avrupa Birliği ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.

Ex-post monitoring



- Informing the NAO about its ex-post monitoring plan; where possible ex-post monitoring will be executed jointly with the NAO ex-post on-the-spot control, when such is envisaged;
- Planning and conducting ex-post ROM review
- Based on ex-post monitoring, decisions for effective utilisation of actions' results will be taken (where possible), which will be implemented by LIs/OSs. The NIPAC Secretariat's M&E Unit will be responsible for the **documentation and communication of lessons learned**



Bu proje Avrupa Birliđi ve Trkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.



THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION



College of Europe
Collège d'Europe





Bu proje Avrupa Birliđi ve Trkiye Cumhuriyeti tarafından finanse edilmektedir.



“IPA II: Taking EU funding to the next level”

www.ipa2teknikdestek.com

